Data Paper

Yusuke Suganuma, Badanal Siddaiah Mahesh, Kota Katsuki, Anish Kumar Warrier, Heitaro Kaneda, Takeshige

Ishiwa, Minoru Ikehara, and Rahul Mohan. High-resolution scanning and lithological data of lake sedimentary

cores from the Schirmacher Oasis, Dronning Maud Land, East Antarctica. Polar Data Journal. 2024, 8, p. 1-9.

https://doi.org/10.20575/00000051.

(Received 9/24/2023; Accepted 1/14/2024)

1st submission

Editor Start Date: 9/25/2023

Editor Stop Date: 11/26/2023

Reviewer #1 (10/16/2023-10/18/2023)

Reviewer #2 (10/25/2023-10/27/2023)

Editor comments to the Author: Akira Yamaguchi

Dear Dr. Suganuma,

Apologies for the delay in handling your manuscript. We have received two reviews of your paper, both of which

recommend acceptance with minor revisions. I concur with their recommendations. Please proceed with revising your

manuscript and also provide your responses to the reviewers' comments.

Sincerely,

Akira Yamaguchi

Reviewer #1: Adam David Sproson

Review for PDJ-D-23-00006

Suganuma et al. present a remarkable set of new core samples from an Antarctic lake that will provide useful insight

into EAIS dynamics. I look forward to seeing the work that comes from their study. Only minor grammatical errors

were found which are listed below.

Grammatical errors:

Title: the Schirmacher Oasis. Please add "the" before Schirmacher Oasis throughout the manuscript.

Line 52: Remove "been".

Line 59: Remove "of".

Reviewer #2: Anonymous

This study compiles data from a challenging and exhaustive lake sediment coring at Schumacher Oasis, East Antarctica. The description of the methods and results is concise and easy to understand. This paper is worthy of publication in Polar Data Journal. However, careless errors, inappropriate wording, and insufficient description were found throughout, and these should be revised prior to publication.

Comments

L.5: Mahesh BS should be Mahesh Badanal Siddaiah ?

L.60: provide→provides

L.59-62: The last interglacial generally refers to MIS5e. Most of the references cited here ref. 12-17 do not mention MIS5e. Therefore, this sentence is misleading.

L.71: Where were the remaining five cores stored? Did you throw it away? This is a data journal, so a detailed description is expected.

L.119-123: It should be written as follows; "Key sedimentologic features were described, including lithologies, visible sedimentary structures, color, grain size, biogenic material, and core disturbance."

Table 1: There are 16 cores in this table. However, the data summarized in ADS are on 15 cores. 19L0503 may be overlapped here.

As for the data repository (KIWA - ADS (nipr.ac.jp)):

- There is a misspelling ("shaloow") in the title. The title in the data repository is different from the title of the paper, is that a problem?
- The name "Takeshige Ishiwa" in Data contributer&Group is overlapped.
- In color data summary (xcel), "Depth(cm)" and "depth(cm)" are mixed. Unify them.

Authors Response:

Dear Dr. Akira Yamaguchi, Editor

Please find attached a revised version of the manuscript. "High resolution scanning and lithological data of lake sedimentary cores from the Schirmacher Oasis, Dronning Maud Land, East" (PDJ-D-23-00006) by Y. Suganuma et al.

We sincerely appreciate the referee's thorough and supportive reviews of our manuscript. Their feedback has enhanced its quality. We have addressed their comments. All modifications have been underlined (including our self-corrections), and our responses to each comment (in red) can be found in the Revision notes document.

We eagerly await your decision regarding our manuscript.

Yours sincerely,

Yusuke Suganuma

Response to reviewer #1;

Grammatical errors:

Title: the Schirmacher Oasis. Please add "the" before Schirmacher Oasis throughout the manuscript.

Line 52: Remove "been".

Line 59: Remove "of".

Reply: We revised these texts accordingly (Title, lines 53, 60).

Response to reviewer #2;

L.5: Mahesh BS should be Mahesh Badanal Siddaiah ?

Reply: We revised the name accordingly (line 6).

L.60: provide→provides

Reply: We revised the text accordingly (line 59).

L.59-62: The last interglacial generally refers to MIS5e. Most of the references cited here ref. 12-17 do not mention MIS5e. Therefore, this sentence is misleading.

Reply: We revised the text accordingly (line 59-61).

L.71: Where were the remaining five cores stored? Did you throw it away? This is a data journal, so a detailed description is expected.

Reply: We revised the text accordingly (lines 74-76).

L.119-123: It should be written as follows; "Key sedimentologic features were described, including lithologies, visible sedimentary structures, color, grain size, biogenic material, and core disturbance."

Reply: We changed the text accordingly (lines 120-122).

Table 1: There are 16 cores in this table. However, the data summarized in ADS are on 15 cores. 19L0503 may be overlapped here.

Reply: We corrected the table accordingly (Table 1).

As for the data repository (KIWA - ADS (nipr.ac.jp)):

- There is a misspelling ("shaloow") in the title.
- The name "Takeshige Ishiwa" in Data contributer&Group is overlapped.
- In color data summary (xcel), "Depth(cm)" and "depth(cm)" are mixed. Unify them.

Reply: We corrected the data accordingly (https://ads.nipr.ac.jp/dataset/A20230907-001).

The title in the data repository is different from the title of the paper, is that a problem?

Reply: We confirmed that this is not a problem.

2nd submission

Editor Start Date: 1/8/2024

Editor Stop Date: 1/14/2023

Editor comments to the Author: Akira Yamaguchi

I recommend accepting this paper as it has been appropriately revised.

Editorial Office's note

Calculate checksum date: 1/16/2024

Algorithm:SHA256

Hash link: http://id.nii.ac.jp/1434/0000051 > hash list